

FM REVIEW 2014 26 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: There is a sliver of a moving story in this essay about a physician negotiating with a dying patient's sister to obtain a DNR; and the unexpected comment of the patient's autistic daughter. To be honest, if it were not for the enthusiastic endorsement of reviewer 1, I would not recommend a salvage effort at all. However, I hope the author can focus more and be more self-revealing so that this grows into a meaningful narrative essay.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: I agree with the second reviewer that the story is not sufficiently developed. The most notable shortcoming is that the narrator does not come forth enough. What was your relationship to the patient? Were you her doctor? Did you know she had an autistic daughter? What were your thoughts and feelings when Beatrice continues to ask that everything be done for her sister? When Silvia made her statement? How did this experience affect you as a physician? Please help us to see YOU in the picture you paint.

Much of the details at the start seem rather irrelevant to the point of the story, which has to do with the daughter's unexpected utterance. Does it matter that she has difficulty eating or that she's on supplements? Is it relevant that she sings beautifully? If the point is to show the aunt's caring toward Silvia, maybe you can convey this through more emotionally-laden language. If the point is to establish that Silvia is most often in her own world, maybe establish earlier that she is listening to music on her ear-buds as she rocks back and forth. Of course, details are important in strong writing, but please make sure that the details you provide advance your narrative.